Multiple Pathways of Capillary Permeability

EUGENE M. RENKIN

THIS IS A REVIEW of our current understanding of capillary permeability and its relation to endothelial morphology. It is based partly on material gathered for a chapter on capillary endothelia in a handbook on epithelial transport mechanisms.\(^1\) For more general reviews of transcapillary exchange, the reader is referred to the appropriate chapters in the *Handbook of Physiology*\(^2\) and to the chapter by C.C. Michel in Bergel's *Cardiovascular Fluid Dynamics*.\(^3\) The special case of renal glomerular capillary permeability is considered by separate reviews.\(^6,7\)

### Morphological Identification of Transport Pathways

The capillary endothelium of most vertebrate tissues and organs consists of a single layer of flattened cells bound together within an acellular basal lamina, presumably secreted by the cells. Materials may penetrate this structure by passing directly through the cells, that is through two thicknesses of cell membrane and a layer of cytoplasm, or they may penetrate without entering the cells, by extracellular channels through them, or through the junctions between them. Figure 1 is a diagram of various capillary transport pathways.

Light microscopy has been used to study permeability of exposed mesenteric capillaries (nonfenestrated) of amphibians and mammals to dyes and fluorescent tracers. Though resolution is insufficient to identify transport pathways on the scale of Figure 1, this method provides valuable information about overall patterns of solute transport along individual capillaries and in specific parts of the microvascular network. Small dye molecules (not bound to plasma proteins) appear to cross the walls of capillaries of the frog’s mesentery unevenly. During the first few seconds of perfusion, patterns of increased density appear outside the capillaries at intervals of 27-30 μm. These correspond closely to the separation of intercellular junctions. Superimposed on this pattern are larger scale inhomogeneities, substantial regions of the capillaries allowing more dye penetration than others. Protein-bound dyes or other dye-labeled macromolecules also show these large scale inhomogeneities, appearing in highest concentrations in localized regions near the junctions of venous capillaries.\(^8,9\) The number of such “leaky” areas is increased in capillary injury, and they may then extend to the arterial side of the network. The “leaks” are often considered to represent the large pore pathway of Figure 1 (A-5 and B-5), though the resolution of light microscopy is too low to prove that they occur in junctional areas, or to exclude the possibility of leaks through vesicular chains (Fig. 1, A-6 and B-6).

Florey\(^22\) attempted to demonstrate endothelial pathways for ferrocyanide ions in capillaries of the dog’s intestine by deposition of prussian blue, followed by light microscopic examination. Although ferrocyanide is excluded from most cells, he reported the appearance of precipitate within endothelial cell cytoplasm and concluded that transport of small ions was through the cells. Later workers usually consider his result inconclusive, due to limitations of preparation and resolution. Casley-Smith\(^23\) used the same approach with electron micrography to demonstrate exclusively junctional pathways for ferrocyanide and sulfate ions in cerebral and retinal capillaries of rabbits. The most substantial body of work on morphological identification of capillary transport pathways is based on much larger tracer substances.

### NONFENESTRATED CAPILLARIES

Simionescu et al.\(^17,24\) studied distribution of myoglobin (effective molecular radius, \(a_e = 17 \, \text{Å}\)) and two microperoxidases (\(a_e = 10 \, \text{Å}\)) within the endothelium of rat skeletal muscle capillaries after intravascular injection. All three molecules appeared to be excluded from the narrow part of the intercellular junctions, but did appear within cytoplasmic vesicles. Within 30 seconds of administration, the vesicles on the internal (lumenal) surfaces of the endothelial cells were labeled; by 60 seconds, the labels were distributed uniformly in internal and external surface vesicles. Passage was concluded to proceed entirely via the vesicles, either singly or through openings.
formulated by chains of vesicles. Horse radish peroxidase (a₉ = 25 Å) and ferritin (55 Å) are also reported to appear rapidly in cytoplasmic vesicles on the luminal surface following injection, with subsequent extension to the external surface within 1 minute. The former also penetrates into the intercellular junctions, but it is difficult to be sure whether this is a primary transit route or if the external labeling of the junctions is secondary to vesicular transport. Colloidal carbon (aₓ > 150 Å) does not penetrate the endothelium of uninjured capillaries. After injury, it appears to penetrate widened intercellular clefts between endothelial cells in venules and to be present in macrophagocytic vesicles of endothelial cells in venules and capillaries.

**FENESTRATED CAPILLARIES**

Tracer electron micrograph studies of capillaries of rat and mouse intestinal mucosa showed early concentrations of horse radish peroxidase, ferritin, and of dextran and glycogens (a₉ = 25-120 Å) outside a large fraction of the fenestrae. There was no correlation between the appearance of tracer and the presence or absence of a diaphragm. These tracers also were present in cytoplasmic vesicles in thicker parts of the cell, but transit appeared to be slower than through the fenestrae. Little or no tracer was found in the narrow part of the intercellular junctions.

These observations point to roles for membrane-lined vesicles, intercellular junctions, and fenestrae in transport of large molecules (aₓ = 10 Å and larger), but do not identify other routes of transit available to water and small molecules. To evaluate the contribution of other pathways to material transport, we shall have to rely on data from kinetic studies of permeability.

**The Cell Membrane Pathway**

Cell membrane permeability has been characterized in terms of a lipid bilayer perforated by small pores with radii of 4 to as much as 10 Å. This is certainly too simple a view, but it accounts for the observed magnitude of membrane permeability to water, for the comparatively high permeability to lipid-soluble substances and to very small nonpolar hydrophilic substances, and for the rapid reduction of cell permeability with increasing size for lipid-insoluble substances. If we assume "typical" permeability characteristics for capillary endothelial cell membranes, we are led to expect the cells to function as a passive transport pathway for water, small nonpolar solutes, and lipid-soluble solutes.

**DIFFUSION OF WATER AND LIPID-SOLUBLE SOLUTES**

According to Fick's law for a thin membrane, the rate of diffusion transport (mols/time) = PSΔC, where P is the permeability coefficient, S the surface area, and ΔC the solute concentration difference. Permeability for diffusion exchange of water (Pₓ) has been shown to be high for capillaries in many organs by the use of tracers for water. However, water exchange in most organs is flow limited, and numerical values for comparison with water.
permeabilities of cells have been obtained for only two organs, lung and brain, which may represent low extremes of diffusion permeability to water: dog lung, \( P_w = 4.4 \times 10^{-8} \text{ cm sec}^{-1} \); dog brain, \( P_w = 3.2 \times 10^{-8} \text{ cm sec}^{-1} \); monkey brain, \( P_w = 9.6 \times 10^{-8} \text{ cm sec}^{-1} \). These were all reported as PS products per unit organ weight from which \( P \) was obtained by dividing by the capillary surface area, \( S = 240 \text{ cm}^2/\text{g} \), an estimate which may be too small for the monkey brain. \( P_w \) for mammalian erythrocyte membranes is approximately \( 6 \times 10^{-9} \text{ cm sec}^{-1} \), and for mammalian leukocytes, \( 1 \times 10^{-9} \text{ cm sec}^{-1} \). Allowing for two layers of membrane in series (the resistance of the cytoplasmic layer is 3 orders of magnitude less), we estimate through-the-cell permeability to be \( 5 \times 10^{-9} \) to \( 3 \times 10^{-9} \text{ cm sec}^{-1} \). The values for lung and brain capillaries lie close to the lower figure. High permeability of capillary walls to lipid-soluble substances has also been demonstrated and is thought to be an important factor in permitting rapid diffusion exchange of respiratory and anesthetic gases. Capillary permeability to small, nonpolar, lipid-insoluble substances like urea is comparatively low, however, and it has been supposed that urea penetrates mainly by intercellular pathways.

**HYDRAULIC CONDUCTIVITY AND PERMEABILITY TO SMALL LIPID-INSOLUBLE SOLUTES**

Table 1 illustrates the range of documented hydraulic conductivities (\( L_p \)) for different capillary types. Hydraulic conductivity is defined as the rate of volume flow (vol/time) per unit surface area and per unit hydrostatic or osmotic pressure difference. A more extensive table is given by Renkin and Curry. Values of \( L_p \) for animal cell membranes lie mostly between \( 5 \times 10^{-13} \text{ cm}^2 \text{ sec}^{-1} \text{ dyne}^{-1} \) (mammalian leukocytes) and \( 2 \times 10^{-12} \text{ cm}^2 \text{ sec}^{-1} \text{ dyne}^{-1} \) (mammalian erythrocytes). Allowing for two layers of membrane with a relatively nonresistant layer of cytoplasm between, we may imagine \( L_p \) for a tightly joined sheet of cells as falling between these values. For the capillaries of rabbit brain, nearly all the hydraulic conductivity of water might be accounted for by the cell membrane path. Both \( P_w \) and \( L_p \) values for brain capillaries support the notion that intercellular pathways contribute little to transport. For the other nonfenestrated capillaries, as little as 2% or as much as 30% of the total \( L_p \) might be ascribed to the cell pathway, but in all cases intercellular pathways appear to be of substantial importance.

Fenestrated capillaries display a still higher order of hydraulic conductivity, presumably due to complete dominance of transport pathways which do not transverse cell membranes. In capillaries with such high \( L_p \), it is possible that the basement membrane or even the interstitial matrix contributes substantially to the overall resistance to fluid movement.

Curry et al. estimated the partition of hydraulic conductivity between cell membrane and extracellular pathways in capillaries of the frog's mesentery from measurements of the osmotic reflection coefficients (\( \sigma \)) of a series of small lipid-insoluble solutes graded with respect to molecular size. The osmotic reflection coefficient of a membrane for a specific solute is defined as the ratio of its observed osmotic effect to that predicted by van't Hoff's law: \( \Delta G = RT \), where \( \Delta C \) is the solute concentration difference, \( R \) the gas constant, and \( T \) the absolute temperature. For a single membrane channel permeable to water, or a homogeneous population of channels, extrapolation of a plot of solute \( \sigma \)'s to the molecular size of water (\( a_v = 1.5 \text{ Å} \)) must yield a value of zero. The observed intercept was 0.10. On the assumption that the cell membrane was permeable to water, but not to any of the test solutes (\( \sigma = 1 \)), they interpreted this to mean that 10% of the total volume flow passed through the cells and 90% by extracellular pathways. Since the surface area of the cells comprises more than 99% of the total endothelial surface, it may be estimated that \( L_p \) for the endothelial cell pathway is one-tenth of the value listed for these capillaries in Table 1, or \( 5 \times 10^{-9} \text{ cm}^2 \text{ sec}^{-1} \text{ dyne}^{-1} \). This is still rather high compared to other cell membranes. \( L_p \) for the intercellular pathway is \( 4.5 \times 10^{-11} \text{ cm}^2 \text{ sec}^{-1} \text{ dyne}^{-1} \) (the area base being the entire capillary surface).

Several attempts have been made to fit single pathway models to the data of Pappenheimer et al. for the capillaries of the cat's leg. These data consist of a series of measurements of \( L_p / P \) for lipid-insoluble molecules graded with respect to molecular size. (At the time of their publication, the significance of Staverman's correction to van't Hoff's law was not generally known, and these values were believed to represent \( P \); i.e., \( \sigma \) taken to be one.) However, no single pathway model has been successful, i.e., internally consistent with respect to both \( \sigma \) and \( P \) as functions of molecular size. Perl tried to fit a two-pathway model to the data. He based the model on morphological data, which led him to specify intercellular slits 200 Å wide with a 40 Å restriction extending one-fifth their depth. By assigning 15% of total \( L_p \) to the cell membrane pathway (\( \sigma = 1 \)) and 85% to the intercellular channels, he was able to get reasonable agreement between \( P \)'s and \( \sigma \)'s, though not uniformly over the full range of test molecule sizes. Renkin and Curry used an approach less dependent on specific geometric assumptions and obtained 10% for the fraction of \( L_p \) attributable to the cell membrane pathway and an equivalent pore radius for the intercellular channel of 50 Å. A fractional hydraulic conductivity for the cell pathway of 10–15% appears consistent with our previous comparison of capillary and cell membrane permeabilities for capillaries of this class. If the \( \sigma \)'s for either model are used to calculate solute permeabilities, values are obtained.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capillary Type</th>
<th>( L_p ) (( \text{cm}^2 \text{ sec}^{-1} \text{ dyne}^{-1} ))</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fenestrated capillaries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Renal glomerulus (frog, mammal)</td>
<td>( 1.5 \times 10^{-5} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Intestinal mucosa (mammal)</td>
<td>( 1.3 \times 10^{-4} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonfenestrated capillaries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Frog mesentery, rabbit omentum</td>
<td>( 5.0 \times 10^{-10} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Rabbit heart</td>
<td>( 8.6 \times 10^{-11} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Dog lung</td>
<td>( 3.4 \times 10^{-11} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Cat hind leg</td>
<td>( 2.5 \times 10^{-11} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Rabbit brain</td>
<td>( 3.0 \times 10^{-12} )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
which are not only consistent with restricted diffusion theory, but which are very close to the values measured in human limbs by the indicator dilution methods.47 (See below, and Table 2.)

Reflection coefficients for small lipid-insoluble molecules have also been reported for capillaries of rabbit heart5,6 and dog lung.4,6 The heart data are consistent with a 10-90% division of Lp through cell membrane and extracellular channels, though the interpretation of John-  
sen et al. is a distributed population of pores, the smaller of which may represent cell membrane channels.46 The two sets of data for dog lung are mutually incompatible, one suggesting an entirely extracellular porous pathway for water and small, lipid-insoluble solutes, the other a cell membrane pathway accounting for one-fourth to one-third of total hydraulic conductivity. Reflection coefficients for brain capillaries47 are much higher than in other capillaries and approach unity for glucose and sucrose. This is consistent with the notion that the principal transport pathway is through the cells. The values for smaller molecules, e.g., urea, are lower than have been reported for some cell membranes, which may indicate the presence of a narrow intercellular pathway. The fall of σ with increasing a, is reasonably consistent with a pore radius of 7 Å which is within the range of pore sizes attributed to cell membranes.48 If brain capillaries are representative of the cell membrane pathway of capillaries in other organs, it is evident that these cells are not impermeable to urea, as we have assumed. On the other hand, Casley-Smith’s observations of ferrocyanide and sulfate deposition suggests that a very narrow intercellular pathway may be present.49

### Extracellular Pathways

Hydraulic conductivity in excess of that attributable to endothelial cells and permeability to lipid-insoluble molecules larger than urea are generally attributed to pathways which do not traverse cell membranes; morphological studies suggest intercellular junctions, fenestrae, or chains of fused vesicles opening to both cell surfaces. At least some of these channels are open to particles up to 100 Å or more in radius. Micropinocytotic vesicles are large enough to transport particles up to 250 Å radius. Interchange of single vesicles between the two endothelial surfaces would contribute to exchange of water and solutes but not to hydraulic conductivity.

### PATHWAYS FOR LIPID-INSOLUBLE MOLECULES

Further characterization of extracellular pathways has been attempted by analysis of measured permeabilities to specific substances of known properties. Table 2 presents a compilation of measured permeabilities for lipid-insoluble molecules of graded sizes. Cerebral, nonfenestrated, and fenestrated capillaries are represented. The procedures used to obtain these data may be classified under

#### Table 2: Capillary Permeability in Selected Organs to Graded Lipid-Insoluble Molecules of Moderate Size

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>MW (g/mol)</th>
<th>Dax (cm² sec⁻¹ × 10¹⁰)</th>
<th>a, (Å)</th>
<th>Cat leg P/O</th>
<th>Same recalc</th>
<th>Human forearm</th>
<th>Dog gastric wall</th>
<th>Sheep lung (term fetus)</th>
<th>Dog lung (adult)</th>
<th>Rabbit heart</th>
<th>Dog heart</th>
<th>Dog brain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Na⁺, Cl⁻</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>314</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>&gt;36</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urea</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glyceral</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hexose†</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sucrose⁴</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raffinose</td>
<td>504</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inulin</td>
<td>5.5 × 10⁶</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myoglobin</td>
<td>17 × 10⁶</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serum albumin</td>
<td>69 × 10⁹</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>35.5</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

S (capillary surface) cm²/100 g x 10⁻²‡

|                | 7.0        | 7.0        | 12.5       | 90         | 300        | 56         | 56         | 24         |

* MW = molecular weight, Dax = free diffusion coefficient (in water) at 37°C, a, = effective hydrodynamic radius (Stokes-Einstein).

All values of P were computed from experimental estimates of PS by dividing by the appropriate value of S. Data: (1) Pappenheimer et al.,5,6 see also Landis and Pappenheimer.† PS/σ was obtained by simultaneous measurement of effective solute osmotic pressure and solute diffusion rate. In the original publication σ = 1 was assumed; therefore, these are maximal estimates. (2) Renkin and Curry.† Estimates of σ were made assuming 10% total hydraulic conductivity was through the cells (σ = 1 for all solutes), and 90% was through 50 Å radius pores (σ a function of a,). (3) Trap-Jensen and Lassen.‡ PS was calculated from solute clearance ratios to a flow-limited reference (133Xe) in exercise-vasodilated muscles at high blood flow rates. (4) Yudilevich et al.⁵ Single-injection, multiple tracer method. (5) Normand et al.⁶ Calculated from observed transport rates on the assumption of diffusion-limitation. The entry for hexose is mannitol. (6) Multiple tracer dilution at high flow. Na⁺: Perl et al.⁶ Yipinsol.⁶ Lung weight assumed 240 g. (7) Grubiswski.‡ Multiple tracer dilution at high flow. (8) Alvarez and Yudilevich.‡ Multiple tracer dilution at high flow. (9) Crone.‡ The entry for hexose is fructose. Glucose transport in brain capillaries is carrier mediated.

† Stokes-Einstein radius, except for smallest molecules.

‡ Hexose = glucose unless otherwise indicated.

§ Transferred from Table 4, where origins are cited.

¶ Sources of information about capillary surface area (S): (1, 2) Pappenheimer et al.,5,6 denervated, resting skeletal muscle. Not all capillaries are open. Casley-Smith et al.⁶ give 3 times this figure for total capillary surface. (4) Casley-Smith et al.⁶ dog jejunal wall, muscularis 40%, mucosa 60% of total S. (5, 6) Normand et al.⁶ Weibel.⁶ (7, 8) Vargas and Johnson.⁶ Bassingthwaite et al.⁶ (9) Crone.‡ Weiderhold et al.⁶ have recently reported a higher estimate, 65 × 10⁶ cm²/100 g.
two headings: (1) simultaneous measurement of transient osmotic effects and diffusion fluxes of test solutes introduced in substantial concentration in plasma and (2) direct measurement of diffusion rates at known blood flow, using trace concentrations of the test solute to avoid osmotic effects. Both approaches present serious practical and theoretical problems which remain only partly resolved. The specific method by which each column of data was obtained is indicated in the footnotes to the table. In all cases, the data was obtained originally as permeability-surface area products (PS) and then divided by a suitable estimate of capillary surface (S) in the organ studied to obtain permeability (P).

Solute P declines with increasing α, due partly to the fall of free diffusibility and partly to steric restriction in the extracellular channels. The first two columns of data represent alternate interpretations of the relation of P to α for mammalian skeletal muscle, based on osmotic transient data. The first column gives the values originally obtained by Pappenheimer et al. These are really P/α, and are equal to P only if α = 1 for all test molecules. They represent, therefore, the upper limits of P for each solute. Column 2 lists the P's calculated from these values on the assumption of a two-pathway model with 10% Lp assigned to a cell membrane for which σ = 1 and 90% to an extracellular pore pathway of radius 50 Å. Column 3 lists P values measured for exercise-vasodilated human skeletal muscle by an isotope diffusion method. These lists P values measured for exercise-vasodilated human skeletal muscle by an isotope diffusion method. These are remarkably close to the figures in column 2.

Pappenheimer has noted (personal communication) that the values of P for glucose in columns 2 and 3 of Table 2 are too small to account for glucose supply to exercising skeletal muscle, based on osmotic effects. According to Fick's law, M = PS/αC, where M is the steady state rate of transport and αC is the concentration difference required. If we take M to be approximately 1 µM sec⁻¹/100 g, P = 12 × 10⁻⁶ cm sec⁻¹, and S = 7 × 10⁻² cm²/100 g, it follows that ΔC glucose must be 12 µM ml⁻¹ (mm/liter). Arterial glucose concentration is only 5 mm/liter, clearly insufficient for supply. Even if we allow for a 2.5-fold increase in S during exercise vasodilation in cat or dog skeletal muscle, a concentration difference of 4.8 mm/liter would be required and this scarcely allows a margin of safety. The possibility of significant carrier transport or active transport of glucose across capillary walls is very small, since P glucose is not above the curve relating P to α for other lipid-insoluble substances. It is possible that glucose uptake by exercising skeletal muscle is limited by capillary permeability. However, it seems also possible that the values of P listed in columns 2 and 3 are underestimates of the true permeabilities.

Permeabilities for capillaries of rabbit and dog heart are fairly close to those for cat leg and human forearm, in conformity with the similar reflection coefficients and with the morphological similarity of capillaries in skeletal and cardiac muscle. The higher transport capacity (PS) of the microvascular bed in cardiac muscle for this class of solute, as well as its higher filtration coefficient (LpS) appears to be due to its greater capillary density. For brain capillaries, permeabilities are much smaller than for capillaries in skeletal and cardiac muscle, and decrease more steeply with increasing molecular size. Glucose and certain amino acids are transported by chemically specific carriers. The tabulated data may be too high by almost an order of magnitude. Yuvalovich and De Rose were not able to measure statistically significant arteriovenous differences for Na⁺, Cl⁻, Rb⁺, urea, glycerol, mannitol, or sucrose. Patlack and Fenstermacher estimated P urea in dog brain to be only 0.6 × 10⁻⁶ cm sec⁻¹, and stated that P's for larger solutes were even smaller. If these figures represent typical permeabilities of endothelial cells, then from 2% to 17% of the urea flux through capillaries of skeletal and cardiac muscle might go through the cell membrane pathway. It is a surprise to observe that lung capillaries, both in full-term fetal lambs and adult dogs (Table 2, columns 5 and 6), have permeabilities to small, lipid-insoluble molecules an order of magnitude less than muscle capillaries and not much larger than brain capillaries. The morphology of the pulmonary capillary endothelium is very like that of heart and skeletal muscle, and its Lp is also similar (Table 1). For the fetal lamb lung, a low level of permeability extends to larger molecules than for the brain, to inulin and even serum albumin, with relatively little progressive restriction. These observations suggest that the “small pore” extracellular pathway is poorly developed in these capillaries and that much of the Lp is attributable to a well developed “large pore” pathway (see below).

The sole representation of fenestrated capillaries in Table 2 is the gastric wall of the dog. Only the mucosal capillaries are fenestrated, but if the proportions are the same as in jejunum, mucosal capillaries account for almost 60% of the total capillary surface per gram, and any increase in permeability above the level of the nonfenestrated capillaries in the muscularis should be observable. The entry in the first line is ¹²⁵I Cl⁻ rather than NaCl or tracer Na⁺, and it is not certain whether the high value of P is due to the greater mobility of Cl⁻ compared to Na⁺, or to a 2-fold increase in the overall level of permeability. The high P for glucose is more significant. It is roughly 3 times P glucose for capillaries of cardiac or skeletal muscle. Assuming the 40% of total capillary surface in the muscularis smooth muscle to have the same P glucose as in skeletal muscle, P glucose for mucosal capillaries would be about 48 × 10⁻⁶ cm sec⁻¹, 4- to 5-fold greater. From this extremely limited data base, namely a 4- to 5-fold higher P glucose and a 20-fold higher Lp (Table 1), it appears that capillary fenestrations are associated with elevation of permeability to water and small molecules.

LARGE MOLECULES

In all capillary endothelia, a low level of permeability extends beyond the molecular size range covered by Table 2, above the size of hypothetical slit or pore models of the intercellular transport system for smaller molecules. The steep fall of P with increasing α, is limited by an extension of smaller slope, which may represent a separate transport mechanism, quantitatively insignificant for small molecules, but important for large. Grotte identified this pathway with a few large “leaks” through the endothelium; Renkin suggested that part or all of the extension of permeability beyond the small pore limit might be...
attributed to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis).

Tables 3 and 4 present summaries of data for macromolecular transport in selected organs, largely derived from studies of lymph flow and composition. The permeabilities listed in Tables 3 and 4 are diffusion permeabilities, calculated on the assumption that diffusion or vesicular exchange rather than convection is the dominant mode of transport in this size range. To the extent that convective transport is involved, they are overestimates of the true permeabilities. These values are probably adequate as approximations for comparison of capillaries of different organs. In any event, they will have to do, since evaluation of convective and diffusive components of large molecule transport is only beginning to be realized (see below).

The data for long-chain, flexible polymers (Table 3) present more or less continuous sequences of molecular size. For all organs, permeability falls progressively with increasing molecular size, with only minor and probably insignificant exceptions. Below a, the fall is steep; this represents the upper bound of "small pore" permeability. Above this level, the fall is more gradual, characteristic of the "large pore," "leak," or vesicular transport system. The data for plasma protein fractions (Table 4) form a less smoothly continuous series. The effects of molecular size on permeability are complicated by differences in charge and configuration. The range of molecular sizes represents mainly the "large pore" extension. For the same organ, capillary permeabilities to dextran or polyvinylpyrrolidone (PVP) and to proteins appear comparable for similar molecular sizes.

Protein permeabilities of brain capillaries are three orders of magnitude lower than for the other entries in Table 4. Even these figures are probably overestimates, since most of the protein leakage into cerebrospinal fluid probably takes place through the capillaries of the choroid plexus. For both paw capillaries and brain capillaries, permeability to transferrin is distinctly higher than to serum albumin, even though it is a slightly larger molecule. Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis).

**Table 3**  
Permeability of Capillaries in Selected Organs to dextran (D) or Polyvinylpyrrolidone (PVP) According to Molecular Size

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>MW (g/mol x 10^3)</th>
<th>Dm, 37 (cm² sec⁻¹ x 10⁻¹⁰)</th>
<th>a, Å</th>
<th>P cm sec⁻¹ x 10⁻¹⁰ (cm² sec⁻¹ per cm²)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dextran</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4**  
Permeability of Capillaries in Selected Organs to Plasma Proteins

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substance</th>
<th>MW (g/mol x 10^3)</th>
<th>Dm, 37 (cm² sec⁻¹ x 10⁻¹⁰)</th>
<th>a, Å</th>
<th>P cm sec⁻¹ x 10⁻¹⁰ (cm² sec⁻¹ per cm²)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>α-Globulin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10^10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**References**

1. Garlick and Renkin. PS = LR/(1-R), calculated for normal levels of lymph flow, L. This formula neglects convective transport, and thus overestimates PS, especially at high flows. These values are probably adequate as approximations for comparison of capillaries of different organs. In any event, they will have to do, since evaluation of convective and diffusive components of large molecule transport is only beginning to be realized (see below).

The data for long-chain, flexible polymers (Table 3) present more or less continuous sequences of molecular size. For all organs, permeability falls progressively with increasing molecular size, with only minor and probably insignificant exceptions. Below a, the fall is steep; this represents the upper bound of "small pore" permeability. Above this level, the fall is more gradual, characteristic of the "large pore," "leak," or vesicular transport system. The data for plasma protein fractions (Table 4) form a less smoothly continuous series. The effects of molecular size on permeability are complicated by differences in charge and configuration. The range of molecular sizes represents mainly the "large pore" extension. For the same organ, capillary permeabilities to dextran or polyvinylpyrrolidone (PVP) and to proteins appear comparable for similar molecular sizes.

Protein permeabilities of brain capillaries are three orders of magnitude lower than for the other entries in Table 4. Even these figures are probably overestimates, since most of the protein leakage into cerebrospinal fluid probably takes place through the capillaries of the choroid plexus. For both paw capillaries and brain capillaries, permeability to transferrin is distinctly higher than to serum albumin, even though it is a slightly larger molecule. Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis). Carter et al. attributed this effect in paw capillaries to transport by micropinocytotic vesicles (cytophagosis).
capillaries of the organs represented. All but intestinal capillaries are nonfenestrated. The polymer data for dog paw (two sets) and rat skeletal muscle (cremaster) are remarkably similar. Permeabilities of dog heart capillaries to proteins and to dextrans are slightly lower than dog paw capillaries. Permeabilities of fetal sheep lung capillaries are generally similar to those of dog heart, though serum albumin permeability is twice as great. The adult sheep lung shows distinctly lower permeabilities to plasma proteins.

Estimates of "large pore" radii for these capillaries, derived from the relation of permeability to molecular size, are in the range 300–1000 Å or more and their numbers are surmised to be much lower than those of the small pores. Accuracy of such estimates is limited by the narrow range of molecular sizes in most experiments and by difficulties of evaluating molecular size and in measuring transport rates of very large molecules. Structural features of these dimensions are well within the range of electron microscopic resolution, but the pores are few and far between, which must make it hard to distinguish reality from artifacts. Attempts currently being made to localize large molecule leaks with the light microscope before studying them by electron microscopy should be helpful in identifying their morphological counterparts.

It comes as a distinct surprise to find that the capillaries of dog intestine, the only representation of fenestrated capillaries in Tables 3 and 4, do not show a higher level of macromolecular permeability than the other, nonfenestrated capillaries (except for brain). It was noted above that for fenestrated capillaries of the gastric mucosa, permeability for small, lipid-insoluble molecules was higher. However, there is no indication that the presence of fenestrae is associated with increased permeability to macromolecules. If we accept the EM-tracer evidence that a large fraction of the fenestrae permit passage of particles as large as 100 Å radius, we must conclude that the basement membrane or some other external structure limits the diffusion of such molecules. The morphological evidence is not clear on this point, in the case of either fenestrated or nonfenestrated capillaries. Further studies on fenestrated capillaries by both approaches are needed to resolve this question.

**CHANNELS VS. VESICULAR TURNOVER**

Palade and numerous others after him have suggested that a large part of macromolecular transport across capillary walls could be attributed to exchange of micropinocytic vesicles between internal and external surfaces. The dynamic characteristics of this process are similar to diffusion, except that vesicles, rather than individual molecules, are the units supposed to move randomly through the membrane. It has been possible, using appropriate models of vesicular motion, to relate observed rates of solute transport to observed tracer transit times. Reasonable agreement has been obtained for molecules the size of serum albumin and larger; for small molecules, much shorter transit times are required than have been measured by particulate tracers.

A further refinement of this analysis was introduced in the form of a theoretical relation for molecular exclusion from spherical vesicles. This has permitted comparison of transport rates for molecules of different sizes, evaluation of a hypothetical vesicular radius, and calculation of the total volume of fluid turned over by this process. For capillaries of the dog paw, the decreasing exchange of dextrans and plasma proteins with increasing molecular size led to a predicted internal vesicular radius of 250 Å, which corresponds closely to the observed dimensions.

Since the kinetics of vesicular turnover cannot be distinguished from those of diffusion through open channels, partition of total transport for a given macromolecule into "large pore" and vesicular components from the values of P given in Tables 3 and 4 can only be arbitrary: such a number of pores if all transport is by pores, such a turnover rate of vesicles if all transport is by vesicles. The difference between vesicular and pore transport lies in the hydraulic conductivity of a continuous channel through the endothelium. In the presence of volume flow through such a channel, an additional flux of permeating solutes due to solvent drag is superimposed on the diffusion flux. Such an addition is not to be expected for vesicular turnover. Therefore, any experimental maneuver which can vary the rate of volume flow could be used to distinguish between the two processes or to apportion total permeation between the two. An attempt to do this for dog paw capillaries was made by Garlick and Renkin who used venous congestion to elevate the volume flow. Their results were variable in individual trials: in some experiments solute flux was not increased, in others it was increased in proportion to the volume flow. It appeared as if, on the average, about half the transport of molecules larger than serum albumin could be assigned to large pores, half to large vesicles.

A more detailed study of the effect of volume flow on transport of macromolecules in the dog paw has been made by Renkin et al. Volume flow was increased by step-wise venous congestion. When venous pressure was held above 45 mm Hg for some time, signs of increased permeability to large molecules appeared (see Landis et al.); the results described below exclude such data. With increasing lymph flow, lymph-plasma concentration ratios for plasma proteins and dextran (un = 70 Å) fell, but solute flux (flow × concentration ratio) increased.

Analysis according to the principles of irreversible thermodynamics and hydrodynamics permitted independent evaluation of P and σ from such data. The values of P obtained were about two-thirds of the values listed in Table 4. The reflection coefficients for these substances lay between 0.83 and 0.95. The relation of σ to un for plasma proteins suggested a restrictive porosity of 280 Å radius (or parallel-walled slit-width of 400 Å). Extrapolation of σ to the molecular radius of water yielded a value of 0.19 rather than zero, which indicates that 19% of total hydraulic conductivity can be attributed to this "large pore" pathway. If 10% is assigned to the cell membrane pathway, 71% of total Lp is left for the small pore pathway (radius, 40–50, Å).
Calculation of the number of large pores required to account for 19% of total hydraulic conductivity yields a figure of one per 5000 small pores (ratio of cross-sectional areas, $6 \times 10^{-3}$). The diffusion permeability of the large pores to plasma proteins according to this reckoning is only about one-fourth the actually observed values. The remaining three-fourths was attributed to vesicular turnover. The actual volume exchange was estimated to be $2 \times 10^{-8} \text{cm}^3 \cdot \text{sec}^{-1} \cdot \text{cm}^2$ endothelial surface, which amounts to $3 \times 10^8$ vesicles of internal radius 250 Å per second. The total number of vesicles present is about $10^{10} \text{cm}^2$.

Taylor et al. used a similar approach to evaluate $\sigma$ and PS for total plasma proteins in capillaries of several organs, including examples of both fenestrated and nonfenestrated endothelium. Their values of $\sigma$ for serum albumin in dog leg capillaries are similar to those of Renkin et al., in intestine and in lung capillaries, somewhat lower. In all cases, $\sigma$ tended to increase with increasing lymph flow. The latter observation suggests heteroporosity. However, until data are available for a range of molecular sizes, further characterization of the transport pathways is not possible.

Summary

Morphological and physiological studies indicate multiple routes for transport across capillary endothelium. However, the identification of the morphological counterparts of specific transport processes (or the assignment of specific transport roles to morphologically identifiable pathways) has been only partly achieved: the contribution of endothelial cell membranes to transport of water and small, lipid-insoluble molecules needs to be evaluated. The identification of the "small pore" pathway for water and lipid-insoluble molecules with the intercellular junctions is not yet known.

References

38. Casley-Smith JR, O'Donoghue PJ and Crocker KWJ: The quantitative relation between fenestrae in jejunal capillaries and connective tissue channels; proof of 'tunnel capillaries.' Microvasc Res 9: 78-100, 1975
40. Perl W: Modified filtration-permeability model of transcapillary trans...
61. Renkin EM, Hudlicka O and Sheehan RM: Influence of metabolic
60. Chapler CK and Stainsby WN: Carbohydrate metabolism in contract-
33. Skeath JH: The storage of water by various tissues of the body. Arch Int Med 40: 140-152, 1927
Multiple pathways of capillary permeability.
É M Renkin

_Circ Res._ 1977;41:735-743
doi: 10.1161/01.RES.41.6.735

_Circulation Research_ is published by the American Heart Association, 7272 Greenville Avenue, Dallas, TX 75231
Copyright © 1977 American Heart Association, Inc. All rights reserved.
Print ISSN: 0009-7330. Online ISSN: 1524-4571

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:
http://circres.ahajournals.org/content/41/6/735

Permissions: Requests for permissions to reproduce figures, tables, or portions of articles originally published in _Circulation Research_ can be obtained via RightsLink, a service of the Copyright Clearance Center, not the Editorial Office. Once the online version of the published article for which permission is being requested is located, click Request Permissions in the middle column of the Web page under Services. Further information about this process is available in the Permissions and Rights Question and Answer document.

Reprints: Information about reprints can be found online at:
http://www.lww.com/reprints

Subscriptions: Information about subscribing to _Circulation Research_ is online at:
http://circres.ahajournals.org/subscriptions/